

THE PRINCIPLES OF
Humane Experimental Technique

W. M. S. RUSSELL

M.A.(Oxon.), D.Phil.(Oxon.)
UFAW Research Fellow, Department of
Zoology and Comparative Anatomy,
University College London

AND

R. L. BURCH

Hon. UFAW Research Assistant

LONDON

METHUEN & CO LTD

36 ESSEX STREET · STRAND WC2

FIRST PUBLISHED 1959
© 1959 BY W. M. S. RUSSELL

1256

636.0085
P89

CATALOGUE NO. 6146/U
PRINTED IN GREAT BRITAIN BY
BUTLER & TANNER, FROME AND LONDON

BODHIRA MEMORIAL LIBRARY
CHITTARANJAN CANCER HOSPITAL
37, SYAMAF, JEE ROAD.
CALCUTTA-26, INDIA,

TO
the pioneer in this field,
MAJOR C. W. HUME, M.C., B.SC.
we dedicate this survey

*te sequor, . . . inque tuis nunc
ficta pedum pono pressis
vestigia signis*

Contents

PART ONE: THE SCOPE OF HUMANE TECHNIQUE

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
I <i>Introduction</i>	3
Scope of the Study	3
Integration in the Vertebrate Organism	7
II <i>The Concept of Inhumanity</i>	14
Pain and Distress	14
The Criteria for and Measurement of Distress	24
III <i>The Ecology of Experimental Animals</i>	31
Man and the Animal World	31
Monitoring Animal Experimentation	33
The L.A.B. Survey of 1952	35
The L.A.B. Data: a Further Analysis	38
The Material	38
The Classification of Laboratories	39
The Classification of Purposes	40
The Tables	44
The Validity of the Tables	45
Results of the Analysis	47
The Latest Developments	51
IV <i>The Sources, Incidence and Removal of Inhumanity</i>	54
Direct and Contingent Inhumanity	54
The Analysis of Direct Inhumanity	57
The Diagnosis of Disease	60
The Removal of Inhumanity: the Three 'R's	64
Contingent Inhumanity and the Problem of Scale	65

CONTENTS

PART TWO: THE PROGRESS OF HUMANE TECHNIQUE.

v	<i>Replacement</i>	<i>page</i> 69
	Comparative Substitution	69
	Modes of Absolute and Relative Replacement	70
	The Principles of Replacement	75
	The Lack of a General Theory	75
	The High-Fidelity Fallacy	80
	Towards a General Theory of Replacement	84
	The Uses of Tissue Culture	86
	Tissue Culture in Virology	86
	Other Uses of Tissue Culture and the Toxicity Problem	92
	The Uses of Micro-organisms	98
	Nutritional Research and Assays	98
	Other Uses of Micro-organisms	104
vi	<i>Reduction</i>	105
	Reduction and Strategy in Research	105
	The Problem of Variance	107
	The Design and Analysis of Experiments	110
	The Sources of Physiological Variance	114
	The Control of the Phenotype	116
	The Control of the Proximate, especially Behavioural Environment	123
	Dramatypic Variance and Specific Conditions	123
	The Behavioural Environment and Physiological Responses	127
	Towards a New Bioassay	130
vii	<i>Refinement</i>	134
	Neutral and Stressful Studies	134
	Generally Superimposed Procedures	136
	The Choice of Procedures	139
	The Choice of Species	141
	A Concrete Problem: Experimental Psychiatry and the Humane Study of Fear	142
	Experimental Psychiatry and the Screening of Tranquilizers	142
	The Use of Lower Vertebrates	146
viii	<i>The Factors Governing Progress</i>	154
	The Personality Factors	154

CONTENTS

The Sociological Factors	<i>page</i> 155
Humanity and Efficiency	155
Flexibility and Communication	157
Educational Aspects	162
Legal and Semi-Legal Aspects	163
Special Organizations	164
The Laboratory Animals Bureau	164
The Animal Technicians' Association	165
The Universities Federation for Animal Welfare	166
Conclusion	167
<i>References and Source Index</i>	197
<i>Addendum</i>	221
<i>Subject Index</i>	229

Illustrations

DIAGRAMS

	<i>page</i>
1 The Expansion of Science and of Animal Experimentation	4-5
2 Integration in the Vertebrate Organism	8
3 The Cardiac Pain Reflex	27
4 Fidelity and Discrimination	78
5 The Concept of Isomorphism	85
6 The Determination of the Dramatype	115
7 Hybridity and Developmental Buffering	119
8 Vigour and Uniformity: the Role of the Environment	124
9 The Pivot Dance in the Male Zebra Finch	148

TABLES

In the text

A Distribution of Laboratories	40
B Test of the Conventions	46
C Positive Responses in TB Inoculations	60
D The Decline of Diphtheria	62

At the end

1 The Survey Returns and the Home Office Figures	169
2 The Numbers of Laboratories using Different Species	170
3 The Concentration of Animals in Laboratories	170
4 The Two Analyses	171
5 The Species Used	172
6 The Usage of Mice	176-177
7 The Usage of Rats	178
8 The Usage of Guinea-Pigs	180-181
9 The Usage of Rabbits	182-183
10-13 The Distribution of Species to Purposes	184-191

ILLUSTRATIONS

	<i>page</i>
14 The Distribution of Species to Types of Laboratory (A)	192
15 The Distribution of Species to Types of Laboratory (B)	193
16 The Mean Numbers of Animals used in Laboratories	194
17 The Distribution of Purposes to Types of Laboratory	195
18 The Relative Demands of Different Purposes	196

Preface

In 1954, the Universities Federation for Animal Welfare decided to sponsor a systematic research on the progress of humane technique in the laboratory, and in October of that year we began work on the project. (R. L. B. ceased to be employed by the Federation at the end of 1956, on taking up other work, and thereafter served in an honorary capacity). In 1956, we prepared a general report to the Federation's Committees, and this report formed the nucleus of the present book, which was completed at the beginning of 1958. (A few more recent developments are briefly reviewed in the Addendum.) Throughout our work, we have received constant help of many kinds from the staff and Committees of the Federation, and over much of the period we worked with a special Consultative Committee, with Professor P. B. Medawar, C.B.E., F.R.S., in the Chair. We have also received valuable assistance from the Animal Welfare Institute of the U.S.A., which also contributed financially to the UFAW research.

A large number of individuals, inside and outside UFAW, have contributed helpful information. Without attempting an exhaustive list, we may mention Dr M. R. A. Chance, Dr Phyllis G. Croft, Dr D. G. Davey, Dr P. S. B. Digby, Mr T. G. Field-Fisher, Professor H. Heller, Major C. W. Hume, M.C., Dr W. Lane-Petter, Dr F. K. Sanders, Mrs Christine Stevens, Dr F. Jean Vinter and Professor A. N. Worden. Dr Chance, Dr Croft, Major Hume and Dr Lane-Petter read drafts of the whole text and provided further helpful comments. To all these people and the many others with whom we have had helpful contact and discussion we are cordially grateful. The usual formula applies: none of them are responsible for any errors of commission or omission in the finished book.

Most of the figures and several of the tables are from published sources, each of which is specified in the appropriate place by a reference to the source index. We are most grateful to the authors and publishers concerned for permission to reproduce this material.

The pattern of random numbers on the jacket of the book can

PREFACE

obviously not be used for practical purposes, since it is only part of the full table. It is there only as a symbolic background for the mouse. We are indebted to Professor Ronald A. Fisher, Cambridge, Dr Frank Yates, Rothamsted, and to Messrs Oliver & Boyd Ltd, Edinburgh, for permission to reproduce a table from their book *Statistical Tables for Biological, Agricultural and Medical Research*. We are most grateful to the members of the Ethology Laboratory (Uffculme Clinic, Birmingham) for their help over the design and to Mrs D. C. Clarke (Department of Pharmacology in the University of Birmingham) for the photography.

As a modest contribution to the Centenary of *The Origin of Species*, the quotations at the head of each chapter are all from the works of Charles Darwin. Few people have been more concerned than he was with the welfare of experimental animals, or more active in furthering the progress of humane experimental technique.

W. M. S. R.

R. L. B.

November, 1958